Software Rights Archive, LLC v. Google Inc. et al Doc. 188

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

SAN JOSE DIVISION

THE APPLE IPOD ITUNES ANTI-TRUST LITIGATION	)	Lead Case No. C-05-00037-JW(RS)
	)	CLASS ACTION
This Document Relates To: ALL ACTIONS.	)	AMENDED [PROPOSED] ORDER GRANTING PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR CLASS CERTIFICATION AND APPOINTING COUGHLIN STOIA GELLER RUDMAN & ROBBINS LLP AND THE KATRIEL LAW FIRM AS CO-LEAD CLASS COUNSEL

Dockets.Justia.com

This matter came before the undersigned Honorable James Ware of the above-entitled Court upon Plaintiffs' motion for class certification. The Court having considered the motion and all other papers filed concerning that motion, and all other pertinent documents and pleadings filed in this action,

NOW, therefore, it is hereby ORDERED and ADJUDGED:

1. Plaintiffs' motion for class certification is hereby granted.

2. The following class is hereby certified pursuant to Rule 23(b)(2) and (3) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure:

> All persons or entities in the United States (excluding federal, state and local governmental entities, Apple, its directors, officers and members of their families) who since April 28, 2003 purchased an iPod directly from Apple.

3. The Court also certifies Plaintiffs Melanie Tucker, Mariana Rosen, and Somtai Troy Charoensak as Class Representatives. Pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 23(g), the Court appoints the following law firms as Co-Lead Class Counsel: Coughlin Stoia Geller Rudman & Robbins LLP and The Katriel Law Firm.

4. This Court bases this certification and appointment order on the following findings, all of which are amply supported by Plaintiffs' well-pleaded allegations, Defendants' own documents, and expert testimony:

(a) ***Numerosity***. Plaintiffs have demonstrated that "the class is so numerous that joinder of all members is impracticable" within the meaning of Fed. R. Civ. P. 23(a)(1).

(b) ***Commonality***. Fed. R. Civ. P 23(a)(2) requires that there be "questions of law or fact common to the class." Plaintiffs have satisfied the commonality requirement here by identifying, *inter alia*, the following common questions of law and fact:

(i) the definition of the relevant markets;

(ii) Apple's market power within these markets;

(iii) whether Apple monopolized and continues to monopolize the relevant markets in violation of Section 2;

(iv) whether Apple attempted to monopolize and continues to attempt to monopolize the relevant markets in violation of Section 2;

(v) whether Apple's technological tie-in violated Section 1;

(vi) whether Defendant's conduct caused prices of iPods to be set at supracompetitive levels;

(vii) whether Defendant's conduct injured Plaintiffs and other members of the class and, if so, the appropriate class-wide measure of damages; and

(viii) the appropriateness of injunctive relief to restrain ongoing and future violations of the law.

(c) ***Typicality***. Pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 23(a)(3), Plaintiffs must also show that "the claims or defenses of the representative parties are typical of the claims or defenses of the class." The same common questions identified above also serve to satisfy Plaintiffs' burden on typicality. The Court accordingly finds that typicality is met here because Plaintiffs and Class Members seek the same remedies for similar harms under the same legal theories.

(d) ***Adequacy***. Pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 23(a)(4), the Court finds that the "representative parties will fairly and adequately represent the [C]lass." The interests of the Plaintiffs are fully aligned with those of the Class, and their chosen counsel are fully capable of effectively prosecuting this litigation.

5. The Court further finds that certification is proper under Rule 23(b)(3). The common questions identified above predominate over any individualized issues concerning the allocation of damages. In other words, "[a] common nucleus of facts and potential legal remedies dominates this litigation." *Hanlon v. Chrylser Corp.*, 150 F.3d 1011, 1022 (9th Cir. 1998). Further, a class action is superior to a series of potentially millions of individual suits. Even if it were feasible for individual Class Members to bring suit, it would be inefficient to re-litigate the numerous common questions in case after case. Moreover, the Court is unaware of any other litigation concerning the controversy at issue herein, and the Court foresees no manageability problems that would militate against class certification.

6. The Court further finds that certification is proper under Rule 23(b)(2). Apple has acted or refused to act in a manner generally applicable to the class as a whole. *Westways World Travel, Inc. v. AMR Corp.*, 218 F.R.D. 223, 240 (C.D. Cal. 2003).

IT IS SO ORDERED.

DATED: ____________________

____
THE HONORABLE JAMES WARE
UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE

Submitted by:

COUGHLIN STOIA GELLER
RUDMAN & ROBBINS LLP
BONNY E. SWEENEY
655 West Broadway, Suite 1900
San Diego, CA 92101
Telephone: 619/231-1058
619/231-7423 (fax)

THE KATRIEL LAW FIRM
ROY A. KATRIEL
1101 30th Street, N.W., Suite 500
Washington, DC 20007
Telephone: 202/625-4342
202/330-5593 (fax)

Co-Lead Counsel for Plaintiffs

BONNETT, FAIRBOURN, FRIEDMAN
& BALINT, P.C.
ANDREW S. FRIEDMAN
FRANCIS J. BALINT, JR.
ELAINE A. RYAN
TODD D. CARPENTER
2901 N. Central Avenue, Suite 1000
Phoenix, AZ 85012
Telephone: 602/274-1100
602/274-1199 (fax)

BRAUN LAW GROUP, P.C.
MICHAEL D. BRAUN
12304 Santa Monica Blvd., Suite 109
Los Angeles, CA 90025
Telephone: 310/442-7755
310/442-7756 (fax)

MURRAY, FRANK & SAILER LLP
BRIAN P. MURRAY
JACQUELINE SAILER
275 Madison Avenue, Suite 801
New York, NY 10016

Telephone: 212/682-1818
212/682-1892 (fax)

GLANCY BINKOW & GOLDBERG LLP
MICHAEL GOLDBERG
1801 Avenue of the Stars, Suite 311
Los Angeles, CA 90067
Telephone: 310/201-9150
310/201-9160 (fax)

Additional Counsel for Plaintiffs

S:\CasesSD\Apple Tying\ORD00055611_Class Cert.doc

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on November 17, 2008, I electronically filed the foregoing with the Clerk of the Court using the CM/ECF system which will send notification of such filing to the e-mail addresses denoted on the attached Electronic Mail Notice List, and I hereby certify that I have mailed the foregoing document or paper via the United States Postal Service to the non-CM/ECF participants indicated on the attached Manual Notice List.

I certify under penalty of perjury under the laws of the United States of America that the foregoing is true and correct. Executed on November 17, 2008.

s/ BONNY E. SWEENEY

BONNY E. SWEENEY

COUGHLIN STOIA GELLER
RUDMAN & ROBBINS LLP
655 West Broadway, Suite 1900
San Diego, CA 92101-3301
Telephone: 619/231-1058
619/231-7423 (fax)

E-mail:Bonnys@csgrr.com

Mailing Information for a Case 5:05-cv-00037-JW

Electronic Mail Notice List

The following are those who are currently on the list to receive e-mail notices for this case.

- **Francis Joseph Balint , Jr**
  fbalint@bffb.com
- **Michael David Braun**
  service@braunlawgroup.com
- **Andrew S. Friedman**
  rcreech@bffb.com,afriedman@bffb.com
- **Alreen Haeggquist**
  alreenh@zhlaw.com
- **Roy A. Katriel**
  rak@katriellaw.com,rk618@aol.com
- **Thomas J. Kennedy**
  tkennedy@murrayfrank.com
- **Caroline Nason Mitchell**
  cnmitchell@jonesday.com,mlandsborough@jonesday.com,ewallace@jonesday.com
- **Robert Allan Mittelstaedt**
  ramittelstaedt@jonesday.com,ybennett@jonesday.com
- **Brian P Murray**
  bmurray@murrayfrank.com
- **Jacqueline Sailer**
  jsailer@murrayfrank.com
- **Adam Richard Sand , Esq**
  invalidaddress@invalidaddress.com
- **Craig Ellsworth Stewart**
  cestewart@jonesday.com,mlandsborough@jonesday.com
- **John J. Stoia , Jr**
  jstoia@csgrr.com
- **Tracy Strong**
  tstrong@jonesday.com,dharmon@jonesday.com

- **Bonny E. Sweeney**
  bonnys@csgrr.com,E_file_sd@csgrr.com,christinas@csgrr.com

- **Helen I. Zeldes**
  helenz@zhlaw.com

Manual Notice List

The following is the list of attorneys who are **not** on the list to receive e-mail notices for this case (who therefore require manual noticing). You may wish to use your mouse to select and copy this list into your word processing program in order to create notices or labels for these recipients.

Todd David Carpenter
Bonnett, Fairbourn, Friedman, & Balint
2901 N. Central Avenue
Suite 1000
Phoenix, AZ 85012

Elaine A. Ryan
Bonnett Fairbourn Friedman & Balint, P.C
2901 N. Central Avenue
Suite 1000
Phoenix, AZ 85012